

HAGENS BERMAN SOBOL SHAPIRO LLP

Shana E. Scarlett (Bar No. 217895)

715 Hearst Avenue, Suite 202

Berkeley, CA 94710

Telephone: (510) 725-3000

Email: shanas@hbsslaw.com

QUINN EMANUEL URQUHART & SULLIVAN, LLP

Kevin Y. Teruya (Bar No. 235916)

865 South Figueroa Street, 10th Floor

Los Angeles, CA 90017-2543

Telephone: (213) 443-3000

Email: kevinteruya@quinnemanuel.com

Counsel for the Consumer Class

[Additional Counsel Listed in Signature Block]

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA
SAN FRANCISCO DIVISION**

MAXIMILLIAN KLEIN, *et al.*,

Plaintiffs,

v.

META PLATFORMS, INC.,

Defendant.

Case No. 20-cv-08570-JD

**CONSUMER PLAINTIFFS' SYNOPSIS
IN ADVANCE OF FEBRUARY 28, 2023
MARKET TUTORIAL**

This Document Relates To: All Consumer
Actions

Consumer Plaintiffs, Maximilian Klein, Sarah Grabert, and Rachel Banks Kupcho, submit this synopsis of claims and proposed agenda in advance of the market tutorial scheduled for February 28, 2023.

A. The Consumer Plaintiffs’ Expert – Prof. Nicholas Economides.

Prof. Nicholas Economides will present on behalf of the Consumer Class at the upcoming market tutorial. Prof. Economides is a Professor of Economics at the Leonard N. Stern School of Business at New York University. He is an internationally recognized academic authority on network economics, electronic commerce, and public policy. His fields of specialization and research include the economics of networks, especially of telecommunications, computers, and information, the economics of technical compatibility and standardization, and the strategic analysis of markets and law and economics. Prof. Economides has published more than 100 articles related to networks, telecommunications, antitrust economics, and other issues in top academic journals, and serves or has served as editor or co-editor of various journals such as *Information Economics and Policy*, *Journal of Competition Law and Economics*, *The Journal of Economics & Management Strategy*, *Netnomics*, and *Journal of Network Industries*, among others. In addition, Prof. Economides serves as the Founder and Executive Director of the Networks, Electronic Commerce and Telecommunications Institute, and maintains a website on the Economics of Networks which *The Economist* has ranked as one of the “top four economics sites.”

B. The Consumer Class.

Prof. Economides will be describing the relevant market for the Consumer Class’s claims. The class members in the consumer action are the *users* of Facebook—individuals that access Facebook through their computer or mobile device. The class is defined as: All persons in the United States who maintained a Facebook profile at any point from 2007 to December 2020 (the date of the filing of this action). *Klein* Compl. ¶ 248.¹

¹ “*Klein* Compl.” refers to the Consolidated Consumer Class Action Complaint, ECF No. 87. Excluded from the Consumer Class are Facebook, any entity in which Facebook has an interest, and any of Facebook’s corporate parents, affiliates, subsidiaries, officers, directors, legal representatives, successors, and assigns. Also excluded from the Class is any judge, justice, or judicial officer presiding over this matter and the members of their immediate families and judicial staff. *Id.*

1 **C. The Personal Social Network Market.**

2 The Consumer Class alleges that Facebook acquired and maintained monopoly power in the
3 Personal Social Network Market by making deceptive representations and omissions to users about
4 Facebook's data collection and use practices. ECF No. 214 at 5. The Personal Social Network
5 Market is the relevant product market that is applicable to the Consumer Class's claims. The relevant
6 geographic market is the United States.

7 A personal social network consists of a website and/or application that enables users to
8 interact with each other—principally the users' own friends and families—based on a social graph
9 and by posting information, comments, messages, images, video, etc., within a shared social space.
10 Examples of personal social networks include Facebook and—while they existed—Friendster,
11 Myspace, and Google+. In contrast, LinkedIn is not a personal social network.

12 **D. Agenda for Consumer Plaintiffs' Presentation**

13 To assist the Court in understanding the Personal Social Network Market, at the relevant market
14 tutorial Prof. Economides will discuss, from the perspective of the Consumer Class, the reasonable
15 interchangeability between Facebook and other personal social networks, and the lack thereof between
16 personal social networks and other online services. Specifically, Prof. Economides will cover the
17 following topics:

18 **Overview of the Personal Social Network Market:** Prof. Economides will provide an
19 overview of the Personal Social Network Market, including explanations of what a personal social
20 network is and the key characteristics that define personal social networks and that distinguish them
21 from other services from the perspective of a user (*i.e.*, a member of the Consumer Class).

22 **Brief History of Participants in the Personal Social Network Market:** Prof. Economides
23 will present a brief history of personal social networks that have existed.

24 **Background Regarding Facebook:** Prof. Economides will describe how Facebook works and
25 will explain why Facebook is a personal social network.

26 **Barriers to Entry and Geographic Market:** Prof. Economides will discuss barriers to entry
27 into the Personal Social Network Market and the geographic limitations on this market.
28

Overview of Other Services Which Are Not Personal Social Networks: Prof. Economides will describe other online services and will explain why they are *not* personal social networks, and thus not reasonable substitutes for Facebook from the perspective of a user (*i.e.*, a member of the Consumer Class).

DATED: February 17, 2023

Respectfully submitted,

HAGENS BERMAN SOBOL SHAPIRO LLP

By: /s/ Shana E. Scarlett

Shana E. Scarlett

Hannah Song (343110)
715 Hearst Avenue, Suite 202
Berkeley, CA 94710
Telephone: (510) 725-3000
Email: shanas@hbsslaw.com

Steve W. Berman (*pro hac vice*)
HAGENS BERMAN SOBOL SHAPIRO LLP
1301 Second Avenue, Suite 2000
Seattle, WA 98101
Telephone: (206) 623-7292
Email: steve@hbsslaw.com

By: /s/ Kevin Y. Teruya

Kevin Y. Teruya

QUINN EMANUEL URQUHART & SULLIVAN, LLP
Kevin Y. Teruya (Bar No. 235916)
Adam B. Wolfson (Bar No. 262125)
Claire D. Hausman (Bar No. 282091)
Brantley I. Pepperman (Bar No. 322057)
865 South Figueroa Street, 10th Floor
Los Angeles, CA 90017-2543
Telephone: (213) 443-3000
Email: kevinteruya@quinnemanuel.com
adamwolfson@quinnemanuel.com
clairehausman@quinnemanuel.com
brantleypepperman@quinnemanuel.com

Michelle Schmit (*pro hac vice*)
QUINN EMANUEL URQUHART & SULLIVAN, LLP
191 N. Wacker Drive, Suite 2700
Chicago, IL 60606
Telephone: (312) 705-7400
Email: michelleschmit@quinnemanuel.com

1 Manisha M. Sheth (*pro hac vice*)
2 QUINN EMANUEL URQUHART & SULLIVAN, LLP
3 51 Madison Avenue, 22nd Floor
4 New York, New York 10010
5 Telephone: (212) 849-7000
6 Email: manishasheth@quinnemanuel.com

7 LOCKRIDGE GRINDAL NAUEN P.L.L.P.
8 W. Joseph Bruckner (admitted *pro hac vice*)
9 Brian D. Clark (admitted *pro hac vice*)
10 Rebecca A. Peterson (Bar No. 241858)
11 Kyle J. Pozan (admitted *pro hac vice*)
12 Laura M. Matson (*pro hac vice* pending)
13 100 Washington Avenue South, Suite 2200
14 Minneapolis, MN 55401
15 Telephone: (612) 339-6900
16 Email: wjbruckner@locklaw.com
17 bdclark@locklaw.com
18 rapeterson@locklaw.com
19 kjpozan@locklaw.com
20 lmmatson@locklaw.com

21 *Counsel for the Consumer Class*
22
23
24
25
26
27
28